

## INTERIM NARRATIVE REPORT

**Strengthening the Associations of Local Governments  
and their Members for Enhanced Governance  
and Effective Development Outcomes in Pakistan**



This project is funded by the European Union

### Specific Grant Agreement

CSO-LA/2016/377-353

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

1. DESCRIPTION	3
2. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION OF ACTION UNDER THE STRATEGIC GRANT AGREEMENT	
2.1 Executive summary	3
2.2 Results and Activities	5
2.3 Log frame matrix updated	34
2.4 Plan for the next period	41
3. BENEFICIARIES/AFFILIATED ENTITIES AND OTHER COOPERATION	43
3.1 Relationship between the Beneficiaries/affiliated entities	43
3.2 Assessment of the relationship between your organisation and State authorities in The Action countries	43
3.3 Assessment of relationship between your organisation and any other organisation involved in the Action	43
3.4 Outline any links and synergies you have developed with other actions	43
3.5 Previous EU grants	43
4. VISIBILITY	44

***List of acronyms used in the report***

ADLG	Association for Development of Local Governance
BoG	Board of Governors
CA	Capacity Assessment
CESSD	Communication for Effective Social Service Delivery
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
CLGC19	Commonwealth Local Government Conference 2019
CLGF	Commonwealth Local Government Forum
CSO	Civil Society Organization
DEC	District Executive Committee
DSP	Devolution Support Project
DTCE	Devolution Trust for Community Empowerment
EC	European Commission
EU	European Union
GIZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit
GOP	Government of Punjab
IUTC	International Urban Development Center
LCAB	Local Councils Association of Balochistan
LCAKP	Local Councils Association of KP
LCAP	Local Councils Association of the Punjab
LCAS	Local Councils Association of Sindh
LoGo	Support to Local Governance Programme
NGO	Non-Governmental Organizations
OCA	Organizational Capacity Assessment
PIC	Punjab Information Commission
SDC	Swiss Agency for Development and cooperation
SDG	Sustainable Development Goals
TALD	Territorial Approach to Local Development
TLC	Tehsil Liaison Committee
UC	Union Council
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
USAID	United State Agency for International Development

## 1. Description

---

- 1.1. Name of Coordinator of the grant contract: Dr Greg Munro, Secretary General, CLGF
- 1.2. Name and title of the contact person: Lucy Slack, Deputy Secretary General, CLGF
- 1.3. Name of beneficiary(ies) and affiliated entity(ies) in the Action: Commonwealth Local Government Forum (CLGF) and the Local Councils Association of the Punjab (LCAP)
- 1.4. Title of the Action: Strengthening the Associations of Local Government and their members for Enhanced Governance and Effective Development Outcomes in Pakistan
- 1.5. Contract number: CSO-LA/2016/377-353
- 1.6. Start date and end date of the reporting period: 20/01/19 to 19/01/20
- 1.7. Target country(ies) or region(s): Pakistan; Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Baluchistan, Sindh, Punjab
- 1.8. Final beneficiaries &/or target groups<sup>1</sup> (if different) (including numbers of women and men):

Final beneficiaries: Ultimately the project will benefit citizens across Pakistan who will expect improved access to local services and improved development outcomes.

Target groups: The action will target one national ALA (ADLG), four provincial ALAs (Sindh, Punjab, KP and Baluchistan), and eight district councils, which will be selected using a transparent selection process when the project is underway, bringing together a full range of at least 1,000 local stakeholders including: elected leaders, administrative staff, representatives from ALAs and local partners such as NGOs, community groups, local development committees, representatives from other spheres of government and citizens, with a role in improving local territorial development.

- 1.9. Country(ies) in which the activities take place (if different from 1.7):

Same as 1.7

## 2. Assessment of implementation of Action activities

---

### 2.1. Executive summary of the Action

This report covers the period January 2019-January 2020. The project continues to make good progress in spite of a challenging and rapidly changing operating environment. A significant focus of the project is to ensure that the Local Councils Associations in each of the four

---

<sup>1</sup> “Target groups” are the groups/entities who will be directly positively affected by the project at the Project Purpose level, and “final beneficiaries” are those who will benefit from the project in the long term at the level of the society or sector at large.

Provinces, as well as the apex organisation, the Association of Local Development and Governance (ADLG), are institutionalised and functioning as part of the governance structures of Pakistan. This has been achieved with all the associations registered; restructured and having elected a representative board; and with an agreed vision and strategic plan adopted by members and being implemented. The staff and logistical support being provided through the project has not only enabled the associations to deliver for their membership, it has also ensured that the Associations are able to participate and play a full role in other development projects designed to support the local government sector, further sustaining their role in the system.

The project is also working at a local level and supporting the LCAs and selected members to better understand and use the TALD process in their communities. Capacity in the LCAs and selected Union Councils has been developed, as well as training materials and modules that the LCAs will be able to use after the lifetime of the project. Ten local pilots are in development with four already actively rolling out TALD and using it as a mechanism to identify and plan local development in their communities.

The project has faced a number of challenges largely as a result of the difficult operating environment in the country. The position of elected local government is fragile in Pakistan, and the tenure of the elected representatives has expired in Baluchistan and KP and has been terminated in Punjab, leaving three out of the four provinces without elected local leaders. This has coincided with a review of the local government legislation which the LCAs have participated actively in, but there is still no confirmed date for local elections in Punjab, KP or Baluchistan, all of which are now overdue according to the Constitution. Although the constitutions of the LCAs protect the leadership and they continue to work tirelessly to promote local government, lack of elected councillors inevitably weakens the voice of the LCAs. The lack of elected councillors in Baluchistan, KP and Punjab is also affecting the ability of the project to deliver fully on all elements of TALD, as the councillors must play a central role in that process too.

Enhancing the knowledge management and communications of the project has been key during this challenging time and the partners continue to build a repository of resources for the sector to use now and in the future, including training materials, and position papers on strengthening the role of local government in Pakistan and enhancing decentralisation in the country. Since the project started there is a much greater focus on exchange among LCA members in each province and between provinces, and the LCAs are using WhatsApp, websites and policy meetings to achieve this. The national conference was an excellent example of the value of policy exchange and debate and resulted in core commitments to policy recommendations to strengthen local government and local government legislation, both nationally and in specific provinces, further reinforcing the power of a coordinated collective voice for local government through the LCAs in Pakistan.

Although the LCAs are not formally part of the intergovernmental structures in Pakistan, their role is increasingly being recognised and they are demonstrating their potential to act as an interlocutor and partner to Provincial government in reaching out to, and enabling them to hear from local government. In Sindh the LCA has been invited to work with the Government to review the local government legislation, and in Punjab the LCA has signed an MOU to work with the Ministry of Population and Welfare to cooperate on local projects. All four provincial associations have been able to meet and build a relationship with their respective

Ministries of Local Government, which marks important progress. All four LCAs are also active participants in the inter-provincial dialogues that UNDP has been facilitating to support decentralisation in Pakistan.

Following a valuable ROM mission in March 2019, CLGF has revised the logframe of the project and also revised a number of activities to further strengthen the institutionalisation of the LCAs. Recognising the importance of emphasising an inclusive approach to local government, a Women and Minorities officer will come on board to support the associations to plan for and actively support women and minority groups in their structures and their work. Building also on the ROM recommendations, but also the priorities of the LCAs, during the final year the project will be focusing on increasing its work to communicate better the messaging and good practices of the LCAs to their members, but also to other actors and stakeholders in Pakistan and beyond. A Communications and IT officer will be coordinating this important work with the LCAs.

The final year of the project will be very full and the timeframe remains challenging, especially since the delay in the transfer of the last tranche of funds and agreement on the extension period priorities, and some interruptions to the banking system for organisations receiving international funding in Pakistan. The two new positions are therefore important additions to the team to ensure that the project targets will be met.

At the time of completing this report the COVID19 virus had just been declared a global pandemic. The LCAs have understandably focused much of their attention on supporting their members to deal with the impacts of this and the lockdown on key service delivery. The measures being taken globally will inevitably impact on the timetabling and delivery of the rest of the project activities and the partners look forward to working with the Delegation as the situation develops to account for the impacts of COVID19 on implementation and delivery.

## **2.2. Results and Activities**

### **A. RESULTS**

This section provides an overview of strategic key results against the six results areas of the project. Significantly, more detail on these is provided in the sections, which follow.

**ER 1:** Five national and provincial ALAs fully constituted and operational, with a clear vision, mandate and strategy in place and being implemented;

- The four provincial ALAs have renewed their registrations; have offices and LCA coordinators in place providing a technical support function to the political body.
- The five national and provincial ALAs have gone through a process of restructuring (renewed all of their political positions) and are fully constituted and operational.
- The five national and provincial ALAs have a clear vision and mandate in place and have identified strategic areas of priority that they are currently working on.
- The five national and provincial ALAs have developed strategic plans which will guide them in tailoring their work to the key priorities identified by the executive.

- To date the ALAs have held 7 General meeting, in a 1<sup>st</sup> instance to complete the restructuring process, but also (in the 3<sup>rd</sup> year) to bring their membership together on key issues being face by local government in Pakistan.
- The LCAs now have the capacity to take part in other donor project (such as LCAS, LCAB and ADLG are co-implementing an EU-funded project with United Cities and Local Governments Asia Pacific (UCLG ASPAC) on Localising SDGs in Pakistan) or become more active partners in partnerships they already have in place (LCAP and LCAKP are working with GiZ within the framework on the project in the Support to Local Governance (LoGo 1) and (LoGo 2))

**ER 2:** Elected local governments' leaders have increased understanding of their roles and responsibilities within local government system and the capacity to play a full role in territorial development;

- The project has been actively working to increase the understanding of local leaders with regard to the role of LCAs, participatory approaches, outreach to local communities, accountability & transparency, inclusion and diversity. Changing mindsets on these issues, and moving from words to action in these areas is a challenge in the very new local government systems in the four provinces of Pakistan. Publications have been produced and circulated to LCA members (e.g. on the role of councilors), meetings have included sessions on developmental local government (e.g. session on inclusion at the national conference)
- TALD training/consultations were organized for LCAs during the National Conference in January 2019. In addition both LCAP and LCAKP held workshops with their executive to build awareness on TALD
- Local leaders have eagerly taken the opportunity to learn from each other and discuss these issues as was seen in the high level of engagement of participants in the National Conference's panel and working group discussions.

**ER 3:** At least eight district councils across the four provinces successfully demonstrate the use of the TALD approach in their territories;

- 10+ district councils committed to undertaking a TALD process. They have participate in awareness raising on TALD and understand that the process involves reaching out in a strategic and ongoing manner to key stakeholders in their local communities, putting together a strategic vision for the future development of specific targeted areas with a leave no one behind ethos.
- Local leaders are eager to learn and try new methodologies as demonstrated through the uptake of the TALD training opportunity where a number of councils will be participating at their own cost in pilot work.
- Dialogues have been undertaken in councils to build awareness, as well as with key stakeholders to discuss district development priorities (District Council Kasure, Vehari and Sahiwal in Punjab and Districts Peshawar, Mardan and Malakand in KPK)
- 4 pilot Union Councils have been selected and TALD pilot projects designed in partnership with the community (in Districts Peshawar, Mardan, Malakand & Kasur).
- Key development issues have been discussed with the Community in the 4 targeted Union Councils and development projects targeted to react to the most pressing local

issue have been developed in a partnership between the local community and the local councilors (and agreed by the project team)

**ER 4:** Knowledge products setting out examples of good practice, including the role of elected leaders, available and disseminated extensively by all ALAs in locally accessible languages and formats;

- Training materials have been developed on: The role of local councilors; the role of the local councils association (LCA); TALD for local councils in Pakistan (TALD toolkit); The local government legislation across Pakistan. These materials are used in meetings with LCA members, local councilors, and District Executive Committees (DEC).
- Position papers developed: one national paper developed on the history and situation of local government in Pakistan with recommendations on cross provincial improvements to decentralization; three provincial papers on recommendations to improve provincial legislation and the implementation of decentralization for, Punjab KPK and Baluchistan. These were developed in consultation with the members of the LCAs
- Materials are available on the LCA webpages and have been disseminated widely in person and through Whatsapp groups.
- Communication and social media strategy has been revised and updated so as to position the project for a wider coverage in 2020.

**ER 5:** At least one provincial government positively recognises the role of the ALA in provincial level dialogue and policy development.

LCAs have been recognized by all four provincial administrations through the following actions:

- Each LCA has managed to have one or more meeting with its respective Minister of LG to present its issues within the current LG systems:
  - o LCAP meets regularly with the Ministry of local government of the Punjab and Since 2018, LCAP is an active member of the provincial taskforce looking at revisions to the Punjab LG Act
  - o LCAS has met with the Minister of local government and has been requested by the Ministry of local government to review the existing Sindh LG Act and suggest any recommendations to be incorporated into the new provincial local government Act
  - o LCA-KP is in regular contact with the ministry of local government and held meetings with the Minister and Secretary.
  - o LCAB has also organised meeting the provincial minister local government and chief minister of the province to brief them about the LCAB activities in the province, and over the course of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project LCAB has increased its advocacy towards the Local Government Minister and Chief Minister, and in October 2019 presented the Local Government Secretary with LCAB's suggestions and recommendations improving legislation for local governments in Baluchistan and revisions to the LG Act.



- In addition:
  - o The four provincial LCAs take part in the UNDP lead inter-provincial dialogues on local government reform which also bring together the four provincial ministers and secretaries of local government, as well as key staff from the local government departments.
  - o LCAP has signed an MoU with the Provincial Ministry of Population and Welfare to support the Ministry's awareness campaign across the province on maternal health and populations control.
  - o LCAP has met with the Secretary of local government and community development and with the provincial Minister of Population Welfare, who heads the Punjab SDGs programme. During the meeting, it was agreed to collaborate and to create awareness about the new LG act in the 36 districts of Punjab
  - o In KPK, the Ministry of local government has committed to funding the LCA with a direct top-slice of transfers made to all local councils, however this commitment has to date not been implemented.

**ER 6:** Effective management of the project, facilitating achievement of project results, good coordination between partners and other stakeholders and visibility for the project.

- A project team is in place working to deliver the project, bringing together local knowledge and experience in Pakistan with international skills and experience.
- The Strategic Advisor works closely with a project manager in London and the LCA coordinators to plan and design activities; implementation is normally led by the LCA coordinators with advice and guidance from the strategic adviser and project manager.
- Over the course of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project, there has been some turn over in LCA coordinators however the LCAs have been active in sourcing new staff members, and project oversight and implementation continued smoothly.
- Administrative support is provided by finance staff based at the project office in Lahore and drivers in the four provincial offices.
- The visibility of the associations has been significantly enhanced as a result of the project.
- An extension to the project was agreed and signed off in December 2019 providing for two additional staff positions a Communication/IT Officer, who will work on project communications and visibility as well as support all the LCAs, and a Women and Minority Empowerment Officer who will work with the LCAs to increase inclusivity and support to marginalized groups within the LCAs and local government more widely.
- The project is continually looking to review working processes and responsibilities to improve effectiveness and draw on the strengths and capacities of staff.

**Outcome 1: "Strengthened institutional and operational capacity of the national and provincial ALAs to better support and represent their member local governments"**

The indicator for this output area is: ALAs will have political structures and be delivering a programme of member services.

The target for the end of the project is: 4 ALAs and ADLG have political structures in place, are increasing their visibility, and are delivering member services (to be achieved by December 2020).

The first three years of the project has focused on the institutionalization of the LCAs. Building the foundation of the LCAs, ensuring they have all the capacity to operate has allowed them to respond to a number of opportunities (such as being full partners in the GIZ LOGO project in KP and Punjab and the UCLG ASPAC EU funded project on the SDGs in Sindh and Baluchistan, among others). It has also worked to strengthen the ability of the LCAs to reach out to their members across their respective provinces (traveling to their districts, bring them together in Annual General Meetings and consulting them of the strategic direction of the association). This project has “built the runway” for the arrival and safe landing of project and partner support from other sources, as well as support the transition of the LCAs from purely advocacy organs representing a limited number of vocal Nazims to institutions responding to and delivering for all councils across the province. However during the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project this institutional capacity of the LCAs has been taxed as the local government term came to an end (or was artificially cut short) in three of the four provinces and new elections were not called within the legal timeframe. This lack of political representatives both within the LCAs to strengthen their legitimacy as the collective voice of local government, as well as as members to provide services to has resulted in limiting the activities that could be undertaken within the framework of the project.

During its 3<sup>rd</sup> year, the project built upon the experiences of year one and two to strengthen the institutional structures of the four ALAs and the ADLG. This involved renewing the registration of the ALAs and ensuring it remains up to date. This year both LCAP and ADLG have submitted application to the Economic Affairs Division (EAD), a new compulsory registration for organizations in Pakistan, which are working or collaborating with foreign organizations or funding agencies. This will place these two association in a strong position to bid for new internationally funded projects at the end of this project. While this registration isn’t needed at this time in LCA-KP, LCAS and LCAB they are investigating the process while also working to ensure their current registrations remain valid and bank accounts are operational.

Over the course of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year the LCAs have increasingly reached out to their members both through the Executive Committees and Board of Governors. Members in Sindh and Baluchistan completed strategic plans to guide their associations for the coming years (which LCAP and LCAKP completed earlier in the project) and the ADLG (the umbrella organisation bringing together four provincial associations) set its strategy for cross provincial support and national and international networking. The LCAs also began developing committees both to support the internal working of the association such as finance committees, as well as though working to support external objectives such as women development committees.

## **Output 1**

### ***OP 1.1 5 Capacity assessment reports***

A capacity assessment process was developed and agreed with their executive members of each LCA. The assessment process was undertaken over the course of first year and capacity assessments reports have been produced and shared with the board and executive of the LCAs. These capacity assessments formed the basis of the work plans in the 1<sup>st</sup> year of the project which focused on putting in place all the administrative and physical infrastructure needed to run the LCAs in an active and inclusive way.

### ***OP 1.2 Better informed membership of ALAs and ADLG***

The provincial Local Council Associations' membership is better informed about the existence and purpose of provincial LCAs through on going outreach by its technical and political representatives to the local councils in each province. The membership is now taking more interest in the LCA's activities and participate regularly in the Board of Governors (BoG) and executive committee' meetings.

The use of ICT and social media plays an important role in keeping the LCAs members informed about the different activities of the LCA. The different WhatsApp groups of the BoG and ECs, as well as other committees and sub-groups within the association provide a platform to exchange and ensure all members are informed on development in local government across the province, as well as on what the LCAs are doing and planning to undertake as activities. They are also a platform on which experiences and good practices are shared. Project staff (both LCA Coordinators and CLGF Project officer) take part in the main groups to be in a position to contribute to discussions as well as integrate issues which emerge into work plans.

In terms of member services, the 3<sup>rd</sup> year built on the 2<sup>nd</sup> year experience and continued to focus on reaching out to the membership and involving them in the LCA's activities. By the end of the second year all LCA completed the formation of District Executive Committees (DEC). While in the 3<sup>rd</sup> year focused to involve these DEC in the LCA activities. DEC are made up of 21-25 members drawn from the elected officials within the District (a range of heads of council, village councillors, women councillors, etc.). These committees form the underpinning of the representation of local councils in the LCAs. Each DEC selects from within its members the representatives which join the LCA Board of Governors (BoG), which ultimately elect the Executive Committee and President of the association. Each DEC nominates a councillor to become a member of the BoG and the number of BoGs varies from province to province depending on the numbers of districts in the provinces. The BoG has a compulsory 33% seats reserved for women. The number of BoGs ranges between 45 and 55 in each province. The project has produced a publication on the role of the LCA to better inform councillors and heads of councils on the associations' role and supporting function to local government which was used with the DEC to build awareness.

A publication on the local government systems across the four provinces in Pakistan was developed so as to increase awareness of the different local government systems and the functions and responsibilities of councillors in each and has been used widely to increase awareness of the difference between the four provincial systems. In year 3 of the project a toolkit about the Territorial Approach to Local Development (TALD) has been developed in English and Urdu to support the pilot councils in the process of implementing TALD. A training manual was produced for the board of governors and committee members of the ALAs (with the support of GIZ) so as to provide a proper induction for the new office holders and ensure they fully understand their roles and responsibilities within the ALA's governing structures.

Over the course of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year the LCAs worked both to increase awareness and building the capacity of LCA office bearers. LCA-KP, for example, organised awareness convention in different parts of the province to engage existing members with local communities in their respective areas, as well as reaching out to local communities in the former FATA (Federally Administered Tribal Areas) territory to raising awareness on the local government system. Another example of this would be the training session for the LCA Coordination and

Management committee members, organised by LCAP with the support of GiZ, to strengthen the committee members key skills to manage the LCA activities in the province.

In 2019, ADLG underwent full restructuring to have a new board of governors, president and vice presidents. In line with the priorities outlined in its strategic plan it worked to build the profile of local government in Pakistan at a national level and draw international best practice into its work. An example of this would be the Participation of the ADLG President and CEO taking part in the EU's Asia wide Policy Forum for Development held in Nepal in September 2019. This provided the ADLG an opportunity to better understand EU policy both for Asia and on specific thematic areas (such as climate change) as well as build connections across the region with other national local government associations and key CSOs. This learning will be key as the ADLG moves forward in the implementation of the other EU funded project it is co-implementing in Pakistan (the project with UCLG-ASPAC on localising SDGs in Pakistan) as well as looks to mobilise national and international funds for ongoing support to local government in Pakistan.

### ***OP 1.3 5 Strategic plans and costed budgets for implementation***

All four LCAs and ADLG have developed strategic plans outlining their strategic priorities for a three year period. They are actively advancing with actions towards these targets. The focal areas are advocacy targets, around revisions to local government legislation, financial sustainability through membership fee collection and provision of services to its members. LCAP and LCAKP have strategic plans developed in the earlier years of the project which they revised in this project year. In addition, in this 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project the ADLG, LCAS and LCAB developed their first detailed strategic plans. Following this development the LCAs, lead by the board and their executive committees set an agenda for implementation. These strategic plans are also an important guide for other donor projects to better understand how their strategic activities can best support the LCAs (As is the case with UCLG ASPAC project which is looking at how the project can best support some of the lobby and advocacy areas highlighted in the ADLG, LCAS and LCAB strategic plans).

Key priorities were detailed as follows:

LCA-Baluchistan the main areas focused on in LCAB's strategic plan for the period 2019-2022 are:

- Advocacy: where priorities include influencing policy making and legislation;
- Internal operations: including resourcing the LCA and ensuring good internal communications
- External Communications: targeting key actors and potential allies and partners
- Member services: developing a targeted offer of services to local council members

The main areas focused on in LCAS's strategic plan for the period 2019-2022 are:

- Influencing: focusing on provincial policies and legislation;
- Internal operations: including up to date policies and membership
- Communications: enhancing both internal and external communications
- Member services: developing a set of service for the membership

The main areas focused on in the ADLG strategic plan for the period 2019-2022 are:

- Strengthening institutional capacity and corporate governance;
- Development of financial sustainability plan;
- Leadership development plans and modules for members;
- Enhancing visibility and recognition using effective communication tools;

- Build working relationships with relevant stakeholders;
- Research, case studies and sharing knowledge;
- Lobbying, advocacy and negotiation;
- Communication, education and public awareness;
- Develop strong networking and relationship with national and international stakeholders.

The LCA Coordinators are working with their executive committees to implement these work plans, mobilise the needed partners within and externally to the LCA to achieve the planned strategic goals.

***OP 1.4 Improved visibility for ALAs and ADLG (including web presence)***

The increased visibility of the LCAs and ADLG has been demonstrated over the course of the 3rd year through increased recognition, and closer relationships between the LCAs and provincial and central governments. However this relationship has been tested through the end of local government terms and the reluctance to hold new elections in Baluchistan, Punjab and KPK. The absence of elected local government representatives in the three provinces has only increased the need for communication as the LCAs must both work to keep their good relationship with the provincial administrations while at the same time increasing advocacy and public pressure for the return of elected local government. This added need for more sophisticated and varied communications, using a multitude of channels was a key consideration when requesting the addition of the Communications and IT Officer who will take up this key post at the beginning of the 4<sup>th</sup> year of the project.

The LCAs have increased their visibility and credibility with key provincial ministries and Ministers:

- LCA-Sindh arranged multiple meetings with the Local Government Minister of Sindh to discuss the issues faced by local government and the LCA. Provincial ministry of local government in Sindh invited LCA-Sindh to come up with recommendations to be incorporated in the coming Local Government Act. LCA-Sindh is in the consultation process to analyse the existing Act and present recommendation on the shortcomings in the Act.
- The President and executive committee members of LCAB held a number of meetings with the provincial minister of local government and chief minister of the province to discuss the situation of local government and upcoming election. As period for holding the new local government elections was repeatedly extended LCAB worked to increase their pressure on the Ministry and Provincial government, and submitted a set of recommendations to the Secretary of local government in January 2020 outlining their vision for effective and enabled local government in the Province.
- The board members of LCA-KP have over the course of the project been successful in meeting with the minister of local government, the provincial minister of finance and the minister of community and welfare on the issues facing local government in the province and the LCA more generally. LCA-KP is regular contact with the secretary and minister of local government in KPK and is working both in these meetings as well as through public awareness campaigns to advocate for revisions to the local government act which further strengthen the effectiveness of local government in the province.

- LCAP has been very successful in building its profile with Ministers and ministries. Beyond the ministry of local government where it now has a high profile, it has recently worked to increase its profile with key members of the Provincial Assembly. Hon Sardar Hashim Dogar, Punjab Minister for Population & Welfare has agreed to act as the LCAP focal person in the Punjab Assembly which will allow him to informally represent the LCA in the assembly and raise issues of importance to local government, as well as act as a spokesperson for the association on issues of importance to the LCA. LCAP has also signed an MoU with the Ministry of Population & Welfare to help them achieve SDG goal 3 (Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages).

The LCAs have also been successful in increasing public awareness of the LCAs and the role of local government:

- LCA-KP was very successful in its advocacy campaigns in the province and arranged awareness conventions in different districts including district Mohmand, a former part of FATA. The LCA also mobilised extensively around the changed to the local government act and the elimination of the district level tier, this mobilisation included meetings, coverage in the local media and culminated in LCA-KP filling a writ petition in Peshawar High Court against the abolishment of district tier from the local government structure.
- LCA-Punjab was very vocal and continued advocacy work in the province, ensuring extensive media coverage around the government's termination of local government in Punjab before its tenure was completed. LCAP's members set this issue as a major priority and LCAP has also filed a writ petition in Lahore High Court against this decision.

Over the course of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year the ADLG has been mobilised by the different provincial LCAs to support their advocacy and increase their visibility around issues of importance. For example in October 2019 the Executive Committee of ADLG held a meeting in Lahore on how to support the local governments in Punjab following the abrupt end of the local government terms. This was followed by targeted advocacy in over the following months toward the Chairperson of the Pakistan People Party, Mr. Bilawal Bhutto, as well as two former Prime Ministers of Pakistan Mr Yusuf Raza Gilani and Mr Raja Parvaiz Ashraf, and Mr Maqbool Siddiqui, Chairperson of the Mutahida Quami Movement (MQM) an ally party of the government at national level. At the international level the ADLG has been working to increase the profile of local government in international forum (such as the Asia PFD mentioned earlier) and build international partnership.

All of these meetings signalled a significant change in the relationship between local and provincial government. They also mark a shift in the way in which the LCAs are perceived and their role in provincial policy dialogue. The increased visibility of the LCAs vis a vis their provincial ministries and the wider provincial assemblies is a significant achievement. In addition to these dialogues, the regular contacts with district executive committees (DEC) has provided an opportunity for the LCAs to reach out to local elected leaders in all districts across the four provinces. More local government leaders now understand the role of the LCA. Accessing and meeting with DEC's and various community groups are also helping the LCAs and ADLG to get better visibility in the public.

The four LCAs and the ADLG all have active webpages since the 1<sup>st</sup> year of the project, which are regularly updated with project and LCA's activities. The LCAs also are increasing their presence on social media, through Twitter and Facebook. The project is also working with LCAs and ADLG to strengthen their presence on the Web and social media to reach out to its membership, as well as linking and networking with partner organisations to share policy positions, and for building advocacy campaigns.

The four LCAs web pages can be viewed at the following addresses:

LCA-Sindh <http://lcas.org.pk/>  
 LCA-Baluchistan <http://lcab.org.pk/>  
 LCA-Punjab <http://lcap.org.pk>  
 LCA-KPK <http://www.lcakup.org.pk/>  
 ADLG <http://adlg.org.pk/>

The LCAs are also active user of social media have Facebook pages and twitter to reach out to their membership and general public.

<https://www.facebook.com/lcap.punjab>  
<https://www.facebook.com/lca.kp>  
<https://www.facebook.com/lcab.baluchistan>  
<https://www.facebook.com/lca.sindh.7>

LCAP: <https://twitter.com/LcapPakistan>  
 LCAB: <https://twitter.com/LCABPAKISTAN1>  
 LCA-KP: <https://twitter.com/lcakupakistan>  
 LCAS: <https://twitter.com/LCASPakistan1>

The LCAs are also working on making video material available on YouTube. Currently LCAP has a YouTube channel on which some material is available (<https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCAXLV3l9E0qLOYB4wqHtPxg>). This work will be further developed over the course of the 4<sup>th</sup> year and rolled out to the other provinces.

The LCA' Coordinators are trained in basic web page development to regularly update the provincial level websites and upload news about the project and LCA activities. With the changeover of LCA coordinators in LCAB and LCAS there was the opportunity to renew the web and social media training and reviewed the focus on ensuring a strategic presence of the associations online and in the media. This resulted in an increase in the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project and year-4 will see more coordinated and wider social media work to significantly increase the profile of the LCAs and the project as the new Communications and IT officer joins the team. The communication and social media strategy has been reviewed and updated.

#### ***OP 1.5 Advocacy materials promoting LG as a development actor supporting dialogue with the provincial government***

With increase in visibility for the LCAs, the need for more advocacy materials has increased. As the LCAs are increasingly called upon to represent their members towards provincial government and other key stakeholders. A position paper about Local Government in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa was developed and disseminated in 2019, and a similar position paper was developed for Baluchistan over the course of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year, outlining the LCA's key asks in the

local government reform process. The ending of the tenure of local government in three provinces has made these advocacy documents key supports to the advocacy activities being undertaken by the LCAs.

The project also produced a short targeted publication on the role of the LCAs in the intergovernmental system of Pakistan, which has been translated in to local languages. This has been used at the district level and in district executive committees meetings to build councillor understanding of the role of the LCA in supporting their local government through providing services and advocacy. These documents will be key knowledge products underpinning the on-going awareness-raising process in the four provincial associations and at the national level as the project moves forward. LCAP has been working on developing video material which can be used both for awareness raising and advocacy (some of which can be see in the LCAP YouTube channel) and this work will be further developed in the next year of the project across all the provinces.

***OP 1.6 5 Financial sustainability/ membership fee strategies validated and being implemented***

In the 2<sup>nd</sup> year of the project, the four provincial LCAs reviewed their membership fee structures:

- The LCA-Baluchistan has approved a membership fee structure where Executive committee members will pay Rs. 20,000, Mayors Rs. 20,000, District Chairmen Rs. 20,000, District Members, Rs. 10,000, Municipal Committee Rs. 15,000, Union Council chairmen Rs. 10,000, Union Council, and Women on reserved seats will pay Rs. 5000 annually.
- The LCA-Sindh has approved a membership fee structure where City District Government will pay Rs. 25,000, District Government Rs. 20,000, Town/Tehsil Municipal Administration Rs. 10,000 and Union Councils will pay Rs. 5000 annually.
- The LCA-Punjab approved a membership fee structure where Metropolitan Corporation will Rs 25,000, Municipal Corporation will pay Rs 20,000, Municipal Committee will pay Rs 10,000, District Council Rs 20,000 and Union Council will pay Rs. 5,000.
- The LCA\_KP has agreed with the provincial government to take a top slice from the transfers to local government equivalent to every City government will pay Rs. 25000, District government Rs. 20,000, Tehsil government Rs. 10,000 and Village Council/ Neighbourhood councils will pay Rs 5,000 annually

However over the course of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project the LCAs had significant difficulty in collecting these fees. In KP the provincial government failed to uphold the agreement for the transfer of fees. In Baluchistan local government tenure came to an end in February 2019 and as such no membership fees could be collected. LCAP has managed to collect some of its membership fees, aligning collection with important meeting. Following the example of LCA-KP, LCA-Sindh is in consultation with the Provincial local government Ministry about direct funding to the LCA so as to ensure consistent core funding. The Provincial LG minister has agreed in principal to this, which would deduct a certain percentage of the council's annual development fund as a top slice transfer directly to the LCA account.

During the third year of the project the LCAS, LCAB and the ADLG developed strategic plans for their respective organisations. Financial sustainability was a key component of these plans. The LCAP finance committee undertook training on the roles and responsibilities of finance committee, as well as the audit and reporting mechanisms of the LCA. LCA-KP organised a two-day training for its members to capacitate them on the role of LCA and



responsibilities of its members. Both events were organised with the technical support for GIZ.

However, membership fees alone, even with a 100% collection rate will not be enough to support the full range of activities the LCA want to offer to their members. LCAP has already begun some mobilising around additional funding for specific LCA activities, specifically is has been able to mobilise a separate fund specifically for its current lobby and fees it expects to incur as it works in the courts to reinstate local government, agreeing with the district chairperson members to transfer Rs. 100,000 each to LCAP specifically dedicated to this work.

In the 4<sup>th</sup> year of the project work will be undertaken with external expertise on wider financial sustainability. Financial sustainability of the LCAs is a key concern of the project and the project extension which was approved in December 2019 included an additional work area to prioritise developing a bespoke Financial Suitability planning with the four LCAs and the ADLG. This work will provide the ALA leaderships with new tools and ideas for substantiality planning, and ensure they have individually tailored strategies responding to their unique local contexts (the specificities of their political, legislative and financial climate) which they can confidently execute to ensure the LCAs can support their core activities as well as provide services to their members in 2021 and beyond.

#### ***OP 1.7 four (4) Women and Minority Strategic plans***

This output area was added to the project to respond to the need to strengthen work around women and minority empowerment within the LCAs (highlighted as a priority both by the LCA members and the 2019 ROM mission). The majority of the work in this area will be undertaken in the 4<sup>th</sup> year of the project. Currently both LCAP and LCA-KP have established Women Development Committee (WDC) to work in line with LCA for inclusive leadership in their respective provinces.

In the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project the work was also undertaken on strategies specifically targeting women. LCAP undertook work in developing a strategic plan for its Women Development Committee. The main strategic priorities are:

- Capacity building: of existing women councilors
- Increasing information exchange: both on policies and programs implemented by LCAP as well as among the WDC members
- Knowledge exchange: Building a common knowledge base and learning community
- Advocacy: around the implementation of and reporting on provincial and national policies and development of a charter of demand of women councillors

Commonwealth Local Government Forum has linked Pakistans women councillors networks to the Commonwealth Women in Local Government network (ComWLG), an initiative of CLGF to

work towards achieving SDG5 and Commonwealth target for gender equality over the period 2015-2030. The addition of the Women and Minorities integration officer in the agreed extension period will also support the further integration of the Pakistan LCAs into this cross-Commonwealth network.

#### ***OP 1.8 2 national ALA conferences contributing to raising the profile of LG as a development actor in Pakistan***

No national conferences took place in the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project.

**Outcome 2: "Improve the capacity of local government to effectively perform their role as actors in local development at the territorial level"**

- The indicator for this output area is: Number of councils that are delivering using the TALD process
- The target is: Councils in the 4 Provinces of Pakistan are delivering using the TALD process (To be achieved by December 2020)

Building on the experiences and lesson learnt in the 2<sup>nd</sup> year the project, and the workshop on TALD held in January 2019 with the 10 pilot councils and representatives of the four LCAs, CLGF worked with the LCAs and the pilot councils over the course of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year to develop and deliver TALD pilot projects. In addition the Project also used the LCAs' wider meetings to introduce TALD to the wider LCA membership and build awareness on the key principle and methodologies. An example of this would be during the annual general meeting of the LCA-KP on 30 April 2019 which was attended by 110 persons.

The project continued over the 3<sup>rd</sup> year to work actively to increase the understanding of local leaders with regard to the role of LCAs, participatory approaches, outreach to local communities, accountability & transparency, inclusion & diversity (all key elements of the TALD methodology). Changing mindsets on these issues, and moving from words to action in these areas is an important challenge in the relatively new context of local government system across Pakistan, and more widely within the Pakistan political context with a strong tradition hereditary and patronage politics. However local leaders are eager to learn and try new methodologies which will allow them to delivery for their local communities. Over the course of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year it has been encouraging to see the interest that many district Chairpersons and councilors have for increasing consultation and outreach to citizens, and specifically in the TALD process as a way to facilitate this. CLGF has been working both with the LCAs and pilot councils is stressing that the process is the most important part of this work. A key priority for the project is to ensure clear and regular communication between councils and citizens over the course of TALD work and to promote this process of dialogue as something that can be mainstreamed throughout council practices.

It is also clear that local leaders want the opportunity to learn from each other and the LCAs and the ADLG provide a vital link to enable this cross country learning. As three out of the four provincial local government systems came to an end of their tenure in the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project the agreed extension has now included a greater focus on developing training and communication tools as well as the possibility to test and roll these out at provincial level when new councilors come into post. The project will continue to work actively in this area over the 4<sup>th</sup> year of the Project.

***OP 2.1 Local stakeholders trained on TALD in 4 provinces***

Over the 3<sup>rd</sup> year the project supported dialogues within councils and with key stakeholders and so as to build awareness on TALD and work toward integrating it into council planning processes. The following meetings with council members took place between Feb and July 2019 to build awareness of the TALD process and secure buy-in from councils to move this forward:

- District Kasur (Feb 2019) Mr. Shabbir Hussain (District Chairperson) and Mr Anwar Hussain led the meeting for the council on TALD. All the members of the council were present in the meeting.
- Sahiwal Municipal Corporation (Feb 2019) led by the Mayor, Mr. Asad Khan Baloach
- District Council Vehari (Feb 2019) led by the Chairman Mr. Ghulam Mohi Ud Din
- District Mardan (July 2019) a training workshop and community consultation was organised on the TALD framework for a diverse group of 50 people including local government representatives, local business persons, line department and community stakeholders.
- District Peshawar (July 2019) a diverse group of 48 people was trained in the TALD framework, and took part in a community dialogue following the training to discuss local development priorities.
- District Malakand (July 2019) a group 50 person consisted of local government representatives, female and minority councillors, local business and community stakeholder were trained in TALD framework and took part in a first community dialogue on local development priorities.

Outreach and awareness raising meetings were also undertaken with key stakeholder groups. Each training session was comprised of a diverse group of about 50 person from across the districts, which included members of local government, line departments, women, youth and minority councillor's members of local NGOs, members of local business community and other community stakeholders. During each session, one union council was identified and agreed for the implementation of TALD pilot project.

- In March 2019, in district Kasur a community consultation was organised to select the TALD pilot project. During the consultation they discussed different development issues but mutually selected the establishment of a community sports ground.
- In August 2019, in district Mardan, a community consultation with local councillors, community stakeholders, and local business people held for the selection of the TALD pilot councils. During the consultation the participants discuss a variety of key issues and focused their discussion around child safety.
- In August 2019, in Peshawar, a consultation was arranged with key stakeholders and representative from union council Mathra where priority development issues were discussed and a key focus on sanitations was identified.
- In district Malakand a community stakeholder's consultation was arranged in August 2019 for the selection of TALD pilot project. During the consultation the participants agreed to focus the project work in union council Heroshah.

The TALD framework trainings are planned in Sindh and Baluchistan in April 2020.

### ***OP 2.2 Toolkit guide on TALD for councillors and local stakeholders***

Consultations with key LCAs members were arranged to get their input in the production of Territorial Approach to Local Development (TALD) Toolkit. Drawing on CLGF assessment and distillation of EU guidance and practice and incorporating the input of LCAs members the toolkit guide on Territorial Approach to Local Development has been developed and produce in English and Urdu.

The Toolkit was tested and used in the TALD trainings in Punjab and KPK. The toolkit has also been shared widely with the LCA members and pilot councils, and has been used in the

implementation of the TALD projects in their respective councils to date (see annex for toolkit). Following testing and revisions through use in the project pilot projects the TALD Toolkit will be an important tool the LCAs can use to support their members wanting to undertake consultative processes and will be available in local languages as appropriate.

### ***OP 2.3 10 pilot projects delivering TALD***

Ten pilot councils were selected across the four provinces and an initial training and awareness raising workshop took place at the end of year 2 of the project, aligned to the national convention. Following this it was agreed to advance with the TALD pilot process in four councils; Malakand, Mardan and Peshawar in KP as well as Kasur District in the Punjab. Council meeting on the TALD process were convened as were stakeholder consultations (detailed above in section 2.1). In the stakeholder consultation elected council leaders and the CLGF TALD support team worked to share the methodology and also moderate a discussion with diverse stakeholder group from across the district on local development issues and community priorities. They also discussed development in terms of territory, focussing on which Union Councils were facing some of the greatest challenges. Using the TALD toolkit the key issues were prioritised in line with the community inputs, and a decision was taken on the union council in which to focus the pilot project work.

Following this a stakeholder consultation was undertaken in the pilot union council where local development challenges were discussed and a specific programme of action was agreed. While the project did not limit the topic areas of discussion it did set some criteria which an agreed project would need to meet to be eligible for the project funding:

- **Low Cost:** The project can be completed with the allocated funds.
- **Short Timeframe:** The project can be completed within the specified time frame and gives immediate local results.
- **Maximum Benefit:** The project has a positive impact on the largest number of citizens.
- **Environmental Impact:** The projects contribute to positive environmental impact (and projects with negative environmental effects should not be considered).
- **Maximum People Participation:** Projects where local community actively participate and ideally share the cost or use the local resources to provide additional support and sustainability to the project.
- **Impact on marginalised groups:** proposals which specifically addressed issues or areas where marginalised groups were involved or where cross cutting development issues could be addressed were encourage.

In Union Councils Heroshah (district Malakand) they selected the construction of hand pumps (mini tube wells) for clean drinking. The water level is very low and people in the area are unable to extract clean drinking water through the traditional methods of manually dug wells. People are compelled to drink contaminated water or walk far to fetch drinking water from other villages. In the pilot project, we will install five hand pumps in dense populated areas of the union council, which will provide clean drinking water to the local people in their village. The project will benefit 300-400 families in the union council and has a clear positive gender bias as water collection falls primarily on women.

In Union Council Makori (district Mardan), the pilot project proposed the upgrading of a road (from dirt to paved) leading to two schools (one girl's and one boy's primary school). This

road will reduce walking time for the children and reduce water borne diseases due to limiting standing water following rain. The pilot project aims to benefit approximately 400 primary school children and their families directly.

In Union Council of Marthra (district Peshawar) was selected for the pilot. Mathra is a rural UC of District Peshawar and historically no developmental work has been done in this union council. Roads and streets in this union council are in bad shape, there is no proper drainage system in the village. In areas where natural drainage is poor and individual house sanitation not adequate, waste water combines with rain and can pick up rubbish from the streets and mix up with drinking water sources. This contributes significantly to the spread of diseases such as typhoid and cholera, and may increase the likelihood of contracting worm infections from soil contaminated by faeces. The construction of the drainage system would directly benefit between 400-500 local households.

In the Punjab Union Council 44 Kanganpur (district Kasur) was identified as the focal areas for the pilot project. Following discussion and consultation with citizens they identified the lack of green space for children to play in as a significant issue limiting the well-being and positive social development of youth in the council area. They community came together to develop a proposal around providing a playing field and playground to meet this need. The union council has committed to match the CLGF project funding with their own to take forward the project identified by the community.

Further development of the pilot work on TALD at council level have been delayed by the end of local government tenure in KP, Punjab and Baluchistan. The project has been advancing discussions with two pilot councils of districts Sukkhar and Larkana in Sindh and looking at different implementation modalities to allow the existing commitments of the TALD pilots to be met.

## **B. ACTIVITIES**

### ***ER 1: Five national and provincial ALAs fully constituted and operational, with a clear vision, mandate and strategy in place and being implemented***

The first three years of the project has focused on the institutionalization of the LCAs. Building the foundation of the LCAs, ensuring they have all the capacity to operate has allowed them to respond to a number of opportunities (such as being full partners in the GIZ LOGO project in KP and Punjab and the UCLG ASPAC EU funded project on the SDGs in Sindh and Baluchistan, among others). It has also worked to strengthen the ability of the LCAs to reach out to their members across their respective provinces (traveling to their districts, bring them together in Annual General Meetings and consulting them of the strategic direction of the association). This project has “built the runway” for the arrival and safe landing of project and partner support from other sources, as well as support the transition of the LCAs from purely advocacy organs representing a limited number of vocal Nazims to institutions responding to and delivering for all councils across the province. However during the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project this institutional capacity of the LCAs has been taxed as the local government term came to an end (or was artificially cut short) in three of the four provinces and new elections were not called within the legal timeframe. This lack of political representatives both within the LCAs to strengthen their legitimacy as the collective voice of

local government, as well as as members to provide services to has resulted in limiting the activities that could be undertaken within the framework of the project.

### **A 1.1 ALA and ADLG capacity assessments**

Capacity assessments of the four provincial ALAs and the ADLG were undertaken in the 1<sup>st</sup> year of the project. These highlighted the significant institutional weaknesses of all four provincial associations which the project worked to address over the first two years of the project.

### **A1.2 Development and validation of strategic plans for ADLG and ALAs**

The capacity assessments were agreed as the baseline against which the strategic plan and subsequent membership and revenue mobilisation plans would be developed. However during the project inception period it became clear that it would not be politically viable to undertake the full final strategic visioning process prior to the renewal of the political bodies of the ALAs and ADLG as it was necessary to have the buy-in of the wider membership in this process through the renewal of decision making mandates within the LCAs. It was agreed by the project team and the LCAs that the process of outreach to the members at the district level and elections of the boards, executive and committees must be undertaken prior to setting a formal strategic direction for forward travel of the different associations to ensure local buy-in and ownership. As such the LCA executive committees agreed interim strategic plans in year 2 focused on three focal areas:

- awareness-raising among the local government leaders and councillors in their respective provinces to the role and purpose of the LCAs,
- building member buy-in to the LCAs through the undertaking of meetings bringing together councillors at the district and provincial level to agree candidates for the associations' leadership positions, and
- profile raising activities with provincial government to increase the visibility and recognition of the LCAs with Ministers, technical staff, and key provincial level actors.

In the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project the LCAs developed more detailed strategic plans in each of the provinces.

The main areas of focus in LCAP's strategic plan are:

- Institutionalize Digital Technology to Enhance Outreach to Members
- Introduce Tangible Programs for Marginalized Groups
- Develop Key Services for Members
- Develop Plan to Achieve Financial Sustainability
- Enhance Mass Awareness on Local Government Importance
- Strengthen Research Based Lobbying and Advocacy
- Strengthen Local, National and International Networking
- Develop Partnerships with Donor Community
- Develop and Engage Supporters in Political Parties

The main areas of focus in LCAKP's strategic plan are:

- Institutional Capacity Building and Leadership Development
- Services to Members

- Relation Building with Provincial Government
- Enhancing Visibility and Recognition
- Research and Publications
- Financial Sustainability

The main areas of focus in LCAB's strategic plan for the period 2019-2022 are:

- Advocacy: where priorities include influencing policy making and legislation;
- Internal operations: including resourcing the LCA and ensuring good internal communications
- External Communications: targeting key actors and potential allies and partners
- Member services: developing a targeted offer of services to local council members

The main areas focused on in LCAS's strategic plan for the period 2019-2022 are:

- Influencing: focusing on provincial policies and legislation;
- Internal operations: including up to date policies and membership
- Communications: enhancing both internal and external communications
- Member services: developing a set of service for the membership

The restructuring of the ADLG was only possible at the end of the 2<sup>nd</sup> year once all four provincial LCAs has been restructured, as being an umbrella organisation the ADLG must draw its governing body from the restructured LCAs. This restructuring was completed). Following this the ADLG worked to develop its strategic plan for the period 2019-2022 which was completed in September 2019. The main areas focused on in this strategic plan are:

- Strengthening institutional capacity and corporate governance;
- Development of financial sustainability plan;
- Leadership development plans and modules for members;
- Enhancing visibility and recognition using effective communication tools;
- Build working relationships with relevant stakeholders;
- Research, case studies and sharing knowledge;
- Lobbying, advocacy and negotiation;
- Communication, education and public awareness;
- Develop strong networking and relationship with national and international stakeholders.

The LCA coordinators are working with the LCA Executive Committees to implement these plans, however the lack of members in three of the four provinces has made this process challenging and has encouraged the LCAs to focus the majority of their efforts on advocacy.

### **A1.3 Develop, validate and implement a membership strategy for ADLG and ALAs**

Building awareness of the LCAs was a key element of the simple three priority strategy that that four provincial LCAs agreed as they worked to prioritise their restructuring over the 2<sup>nd</sup> year of the project. In the third year LCAs and ADLG developed strategic plans for the coming years and a key focal area was membership expansion and consolidation.

Membership fees are recognised as an important element in underpinning the long term sustainability and the political credibility of the LCAs have been discussed and reviewed by each association. In the 2<sup>nd</sup> year of the project the four provincial LCAs developed membership fee structures which they reviewed in the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project. These have been agreed as:

- The LCA-Baluchistan has approved a membership fee structure where Executive committee members will pay Rs. 20,000, Mayors Rs. 20,000, District Chairmen Rs. 20,000, District Members, Rs. 10,000, Municipal Committee Rs. 15,000, Union Council chairmen Rs. 10,000, Union Council, and Women on reserved seats will pay Rs. 5000 annually.
- The LCA-Sindh has approved a membership fee structure where City District Government will pay Rs. 25,000, District Government Rs. 20,000, Town/Tehsil Municipal Administration Rs. 10,000 and Union Councils will pay Rs. 5000 annually.
- The LCA-Punjab approved a membership fee structure where Metropolitan Corporation will pay Rs 25,000, Municipal Corporation will pay Rs 20,000, Municipal Committee will pay Rs 10,000, District Council Rs 20,000 and Union Council will pay Rs. 5,000.
- The LCA-KP has agreed with the provincial government to take a top slice from the transfers to local government equivalent to every City government will pay Rs. 25000, District government Rs. 20,000, Tehsil government Rs. 10,000 and Village Council/ Neighbourhood councils will pay Rs 5,000 annually

Currently the all the LCAs, and LCAB and LCAS acutely, are dependent on donor-funded projects for their organizational development and operational requirements. LCAB and LCAS are clear that they must become self-sustaining before the end of the project, and have included this as a priority in their strategic plans, looking to expand their membership drive to the lower levels of local government i.e. tehsil and union councils and collect annual membership fee from all member local governments in the province. All four of the provincial LCAs undertook work through their BoG members and the Membership Development Committee to reach out to local governments in all districts of the province and collect pre-determined membership fees. However over the course of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project the LCAs had significant difficulty in collecting these fees. In KP the provincial government failed to uphold the agreement for the transfer of fees. In Baluchistan local government tenure came to an end in February 2019 and as such no membership fees could be collected. Following the example of LCA-KP, LCA-Sindh is in consultation with the local government ministry of Sindh about providing core funding for the association by deduct a certain percentage of all councils' annual development funds as a top slice transfer directly to the LCA. The Provincial Minister of local government has agreed in principal to this. In addition to membership fees, the LCAB and LCAS have been looking at possible strategies to mobilise individual and corporate philanthropists for donations and sponsorship. The LCAs are all clear that additional support on financial sustainability is needed.

Due to the end of local government tenures in KP, Baluchistan and the Punjab expanding the membership was challenging. However both LCAP and LCAKP undertook significant outreach at district level mobilising councillors around representations to provincial government to reinstate local government. LCA-KP was very successful in mobilising its membership through its advocacy campaigns in the province. It also arranged awareness conventions in different districts including district Mohmand, the former part of FATA. LCA-Punjab mobilised its members actively in advocacy work in the province in protest of the government' termination of local government in Punjab before its tenure was completed.

The LCAs worked to maintain regular contacts with district executive committees (DEC) which provide an important outlet for the LCAs to reach their local membership and better understand the needs of local elected leaders in all districts across the four provinces. More local government leaders now understand the role of the LCA and the work that it is doing on



their behalf. Accessing and meeting with DEC's and various community groups are also helping the LCAs and ADLG to get better visibility in the public.

Currently the LCAs are heavily dependent on donor-funded projects for its organizational development and operational requirements. In the long run, however, the LCAs would need to generate its own resources for its day to day operation. As such the LCAs have requested that the project provide tailored support on financial sustainability which was agreed with the EU through the project extension process and will be a key activity in the 4<sup>th</sup> year of the project.

#### **A 1.4 Consultation meetings and ALA General Meetings held**

All four LCAs also held regular executive committee meeting to discuss priorities and challenges being faced by the LCA. In Baluchistan, KP and Punjab these meetings were key in organizing plans for advocacy and actions towards provincial government.

In addition to these internal operation meetings the LCAs held a number of consultative as well as outward facing meetings. Examples of which include:

- LCA-KP arranged awareness conventions on the importance of local government in different districts of the province, including district Mohmand, the former part of FATA.
- LCAS brought its board of governors together for a workshop on strategic planning and a 1<sup>st</sup> discussion on changes needed in the local government act in April 2019.
- LCAP brought together its Women's Development Committee to develop a strategic plan of action for addressing the key issues facing elected and prospective women in local government in January 2019
- LCAKP called a convention of members to discuss strategic priorities and develop their proposal to Provincial government in rebuttal for the elimination of the District tier of local government (in January) and held a series of 5 division convention on the issue between February and March 2019 (each convention bringing together +200 members), and in April 2019 held a cross-provincial general meeting to discuss the outcomes of these division conventions and strategies to respond to the ongoing challenges facing local government.

The ADLG, which was formerly reconstituted in January 2019 networked the provincial LCAs over the course of this project year and brought its board of governors together in September to validate the work undertaken on strategic planning. The ADLG also linked the LCA members into a set on international meetings such as the PlusNet network and the EU Asia Policy forum for development.

#### **A 1.5 2 ADLG national conferences undertaken**

2<sup>nd</sup> national conference is planned in year 4.

#### ***ER 2: Elected local governments' leaders have increased understanding of their roles and responsibilities within local government system and the capacity to play a full role in territorial development***

The project continued over the 3<sup>rd</sup> year to work actively to increase the understanding of local leaders with regard to the role of LCAs, participatory approaches, outreach to local communities, accountability & transparency, inclusion & diversity (all key elements of the TALD methodology). Changing mindsets on these issues, and moving from words to action in these areas is an important challenge in the relatively new context of local government

system across Pakistan, and more widely within the Pakistan political context with a strong tradition hereditary and patronage politics. However local leaders are eager to learn and try new methodologies which will allow them to delivery for their local communities. This has been demonstrated through the uptake of the TALD training opportunity where a number of councils will be participating at their own cost in pilot work or matching project funding to allow them to increase the impact of the TALD interventions. It is also clear that local leaders want the opportunity to learn from each other and the LCAs and the ADLG provide a vital link to enable this cross country learning. As three out of the four provincial local government systems came to an end of their tenure in the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project the agreed extension has now included a greater focus on developing training and communication tools as well as the possibility to test and roll these out at provincial level when new councilors come into post. The project will continue to work actively in this area over the 4<sup>th</sup> year of the Project.

### **A2.1 TALD workshops delivered**

Each of the four provincial LCAs has undertaken internal discussions on the Territorial Approach to Local Development (TALD). It was agreed that workshops with the LCA membership should be targeted towards the LCA board of governors in a first instance so as to ensure a clear understanding and leadership from the LCA on this important mechanism for people centered local governance.

A cross provincial workshop was delivered for LCA Secretaries General, targeting board members and representatives of pilot councils at the end of the 2nd year and TALD workshop were undertaken with the members of LCAP (January 2019) and LCAKP (July 2019). These workshops provided an overview of the TALD approach and how this can be fostered in Pakistan as well as discussing concrete 1<sup>st</sup> steps with regard to (1) focusing the location, (2) selecting stakeholders, (3) identifying challenges and priorities, and (4) concrete implementation. The outcomes of using the TALD framework is that it improves decision making and can help to deliver concrete development results through social services, infrastructure and local environmental management. Majority of the participants in these workshop expressed frustration at current systems which allow little to no flexibility in how councils implement development funds.

In Sindh the LCA was not prepared to begin work and raising awareness on TALD prior to undertaking the review of strategic priorities and development of its new strategic plan. As such a workshop on TALD is planned for the LCA in the 1<sup>st</sup> quarter of year 4.

In Baluchistan as the term of local government came to an end in February 2019 it was agreed that LCAB would wait for the election of new councilors prior to undertaking the TALD training, and priorities this at the beginning of the new local government term to maximize the potential uptake among its members. As elections were initially planned for August 2019 it was expected this would allow sufficient time to support the LCA in its TALD outreach prior to the end of the project (originally January 2020), As the Baluchistan local elections were progressively and repeatedly delayed, and additional provinces ended the mandate of local government without announcing dates for new elections this became an important element in the need for a extension which was agreed between CLGF and the EUD in December 2019.

**A2.2 Develop a guide for councillors on TALD and their role in local development**

The toolkit guide on Territorial Approach to Local Development has been developed, and produced in both English and Urdu.

The TALD toolkit for the pilot councils is made up of three main section:

- An introductory sections which introduces the concept of TALD, its origin and key elements
- A proposed methodology to follow for implementation, which includes: setting of teams and fixing responsibilities; gathering key data; analysing data and setting priorities; and developing a plan of actions
- A mapping tool which help participants in the process locate assets and problems within their specific territory of work

The 1<sup>st</sup> section provides an overview of the difference in thinking and approach between TALD and more traditional top down planning. It looks at where TALD comes from, what its basic features are and why it is a useful approach. It provides some example of TALD outcomes and insists on the importance of buy in to the process as a key product at the end of any TALD pilot programme. The 2<sup>nd</sup> section propose different methodologies for undertaking TALD, exploring the formation of planning teams, fixing responsibilities and gathering key data. It also presents inputs on key stakeholders and how to ensure an inclusive process. Finally the 3<sup>rd</sup> section supports the user through a mapping and planning process.

The guide has been shared with the LCAs and is being used as a tool guiding the TALD pilot process, This is both supporting the TALD pilots but also being used as a way to refine and improve the toolkit so as to produce a revised version which can be circulated along with the TALD pilot case studies once completed. (see annex for tool)

**A2.3 Web content on TALD developed**

Web content has been developed on TALD and is available on all LCA webpages. This will be added to as the work on TALD evolves and the case studies of the pilot projects are put together over the course of year 4<sup>th</sup> of the project. The additional capacity provided by new Communications and IT officer planned into the extension will allow the project to increase this coverage and outreach.

**Activity 2.4: Councillor Inception Training**

Over the course of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year the project consolidated existing learning tools and training methodologies. However the development of the tailored training methodologies will be undertaken in the 4<sup>th</sup> year of the project once the revisions to the Local Government Acts are agreed so as to tailor to these acts. The CLGF project team will work closely with the 4 LCAs to develop the framework and identify the priority areas for the tailored provincial training methodologies and ensure the training can capitalise on the added value of the LCAs.

**Activity 2.5: Online training tools**

These will be developed in the 4<sup>th</sup> year of the project

***ER 3: At least eight district councils across the four provinces successfully demonstrate the use of the TALD approach in their territories***

10 councils have been put forward by their provincial LCA to take part in the pilot work on TALD. They have all shown strong interest to use the TALD approach in their respective councils, and have committed to the selections criteria prepared and agreed in the 2<sup>nd</sup> year of the project. Following the training workshop with the 10 pilot councils at the end of the 2<sup>nd</sup> year of the project work was undertaken in 4 councils over the council of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project. These four councils have increased awareness with the council and with key stakeholders on the TALD process and have advanced with their local consultation processes and developed their specific pilot interventions.

### A3.1 Selection of 10 pilot councils

10+ pilot councils/districts have committed to take forward the TALD approach and have been approved as pilots within the project by their respective LCA Executive Committees.

### A3.2 Pilot projects implemented

Ten pilot councils were selected across the four provinces and an initial training and awareness raising workshop took place at the end of year 2 of the project, aligned to the national convention. Following this it was agreed to advance with the TALD pilot process in four councils; Malakand, Mardan and Peshawar in KP as well as Kasur District in the Punjab. Council meeting on the TALD process were convened as were stakeholder consultations. In the stakeholder consultation elected council leaders and the CLGF TALD support team worked to share the methodology and also moderate a discussion with diverse stakeholder group from across the district on local development issues and community priorities. They also discussed development in terms of territory, focussing on what Union Councils were facing some of the greatest challenges. Using the TALD toolkit the key issues were prioritised in line with the community inputs, and a decisions on the union council in which to focus the pilot project work was selected.

Following this a stakeholder consultation was undertaken in the pilot union council where local development challenges were discussed and a specific programme of action was agreed. While the project did not limit the topics or areas of discussion it did set some criteria which an agreed project would need to meet to be eligible for project funding:

- **Low Cost:** The project can be completed with the allocated funds.
- **Short Timeframe:** The project can be completed within the specified time frame and gives immediate local results.
- **Maximum Benefit:** The project has a positive impact on the largest number of citizens.
- **Environmental Impact:** The projects contribute to positive environmental impact (and projects with negative environmental effects should not be considered).
- **Maximum People Participation:** Projects where local community actively participate and ideally share the cost or use the local resources to provide additional support and sustainability to the project.
- **Impact on marginalised groups:** proposals which specifically addressed issues or areas where marginalised groups were involved or where cross cutting development issues could be addressed were encourage.

In district Malakand they selected the construction of hand pumps (mini tube wells ) for clean dirking. The water level is very low and people in the area are unable to extract clean

drinking water through the traditional methods of manually dug wells. People are compelled to drink contaminated water or walk far to fetch drinking water from other villages. In the pilot project, we will install five Hand pumps in dense populated areas of the UC, which will provide clean drinking water to the local people in their village. The project will benefit 300-400 families in the union council and has a clear positive gender bias as water collection falls primarily on women.

In district, Mardan the pilot project proposed the upgrading of a road (from dirt to paved) leading to two schools (one girls and one boys primary school). This road will reduce walking time for the children and reduce water borne diseases due to limiting standing water following rain. The pilot project aims to benefit approximately 400 primary school children and their families directly.

In district Peshawar, the Union Council (UC) of Mathra was selected for the pilot. Mathra is a rural UC of District Peshawar and historically no developmental work has been done in this UC. Roads and streets in this union council are in bad shape and there is no proper drainage system in the village. In areas where natural drainage is poor and individual house sanitation not adequate, waste water combines with rain and can pick up rubbish from the streets and mix up with drinking water sources. This contributes significantly to the spread of diseases such as typhoid and cholera, and may increase the likelihood of contracting worm infections from soil contaminated by faeces. The construction of the drainage system would directly benefit between 400-500 local households.

In the Punjab District Kasur identified Union Council 44 Kanganpur as the focal areas for the pilot project. Following discussion and consultation with citizens they identified the lack of green space for children to play in was a significant issue limiting the well-being and positive social development of youth in the council area. The community proposed the development of a playing field and playground to provide a safe and healthy activity area. The Union Council has committed to match the CLGF project funding with their own to take forward the project identified by the community.

Further development of the pilot work on TALD at council level have been delayed by the end of local government tenure in KP, Punjab and Baluchistan. For example elected local government complete its tenure in Baluchistan in February 2019 before the TALD activities could be initiated. As such it was agreed with the pilot councils to wait until after the new elections (planned for June 2019) to undertake the TALD work. While elections were to be held within 90 days following the tenure completion, however these were repeatedly postponed and at the end of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project they were expected in early of 2020. The project has been advancing discussions with the two pilot councils agreed in Sindh, specifically the districts Sukkhar and Larkana and an early mission on 2020 is planned to begin the process of implementation with these two councils. The project is also looking at different implementation modalities to allow the existing commitments of the TALD pilots to be met within the extended timeframe of the project.

***ER 4: Knowledge products setting out examples of good practice, including the role of elected leaders, available and disseminated extensively by all ALAs in locally accessible languages and formats;***

Knowledge products and position papers have been developed over the course of the project to date, reflecting the needs of the LCAs both in outreach to their members (used in meetings with local council members, District Executive Committees (DEC), LCA Board of Governors and Executive Committees), as well as in advocating for the improvement of the local government systems, advocating against retrograde steps in the decentralization process, and sharing good practices in local development (used towards Ministries, Members of parliament, civil society organisations and development partners). These have also been disseminated through the LCA webpages and through Whatsapp groups. The 4<sup>th</sup> year of the project will see an intensification of knowledge product development in-line with the LCA strategic plans and drawing on the additional capacity of the new officers planned into the extension period .

To date the following have been produced:

- A comparative report on the local government systems in the four provinces. This report has been used to increase awareness with external actors, including the provincial administrations on the difference in responsibilities and levels of empowerment under the different local government systems in the four provinces.
- A position paper has been prepared by LCA-KP reviewing the existing KP legislation for local government and assessing the key strengths and weaknesses
- A position paper has been prepared by LCAB on proposal to improve local government's ability to deliver in Baluchistan
- A position paper on the local government system in Pakistan "Local Government – A Partner in National Development" was developed as the background paper for the National conference in January 2019. This paper provided an overview of the advances to date in local government policy reform and the challenges identified by the provincial LCAs that remain to be addressed so that local government can play its important role in supporting national development.
- Training material has been produced on the TALD process and has been shared with LCAs to upload onto their webpages, and the TALD Toolkit has been developed and is being tested through the implementation with the pilot councils.
- Guidebooks for councillors have been developed and tailored to the realities of each province in Pakistan to support capacity building among the LCA membership.
- Publication on the role of the LCA has also been developed and used in a number of training and awareness raising meetings with new councils and councillors learning about the LCAs

#### **A4.1 Websites and web materials developed for ADLG and ALAs**

Websites, Facebook pages and twitter accounts are in place for LCAs and regularly updated. The content is province specific and reflects the needs and priorities of local government in each province.

LCA-Sindh <http://lcas.org.pk/>

LCA-Baluchistan <http://lcab.org.pk/>

LCA-Punjab <http://lcap.org.pk>

LCA-KPK <http://www.lcakup.org.pk/>

The project is continues to work to strengthen its presence on social media through Facebook which is an especially useful and important platform used to update members and other interested parties on key meetings and policy advances with provincial government and other important partners.

<https://www.facebook.com/lcap.punjab>  
<https://www.facebook.com/lca.kp>  
<https://www.facebook.com/lcab.baluchistan>  
<https://www.facebook.com/lca.sindh.7>

The project is also working to strengthen its presence on twitter which is an important means of sharing policy positions and building advocacy campaigns, particularly helpful in reaching out to and linking with partner organisations.

@LcapPakistan

@lcakppakistan

@LCABPAKISTAN1

@LCASPAKISTAN1

The LCAs have also begun exploring the use of video content and YouTube (which can be seen here: <https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCAXLV3I9E0qLOYB4wqHtPxg>) this will be further developed in the 4<sup>th</sup> year of the project.

Association for the Development of Local Governance (ADLG) is an umbrella association, which provides the provincial LCAs a voice on the federal level. ADLG has an active website and active on different social media platforms to advocate for the Local government in general and Local Council Associations in particular.

ADLG <http://adlg.org.pk/>

Over the course of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project, the provincial LCAs have increased their web presence across these platforms and it is expected with the presence of a dedicated Communications officer in the 4<sup>th</sup> year that the project and the LCAs will be in a position to further strengthen both their internal and external communications.

***ER 5: At least one provincial government positively recognises the role of the ALA in provincial level dialogue and policy development.***

The LCAs have been recognized by all four provincial administrations. Each LCA has managed to have one or more meetings with its respective Minister of local government to present key issues facing local government in the province - key evidence of the increased recognition of their role by provincial government.

In KP the LCA and Ministry had a strong cooperative relationship, however this has deteriorated over the course of year 3 due to unilateral changes made to the local government Act by the Province, eliminating the District level of local government, as well as other changes which LCAKP considers disempowering to local government. In the Punjab LCAP is an active member of the provincial taskforce looking at revisions to the Punjab LG Act, and has signed an MoU with the Ministry of Population Welfare to support the dissemination of their policies at local level. In Sindh the LCA has been requested by the Ministry of local government to provide input to revisions of the local government act which it is in the process of developing. In Baluchistan the LCA held a number of meetings with the Chief Minister and Minister of local government to brief them on the issues of local councils and advocate for timely election of local government in the province, and presented its position paper. In addition, all LCAs take part in the inter-provincial dialogues organized by UNDP which

brings local government together with provincial and national actors to reflect on the local government system in Pakistan. This recognition of the LCAs as legitimate actors in the intergovernmental framework is a significant step forward compared to the refusal to meet with any LCA representative when the original LG Acts were being developed.

### **A5.1 Production and use of advocacy strategy and materials**

Visibility of LCAs has been increased in all provinces through holding district and union council level meetings, forming District Executive Committees (DECs) and re-structuring the LCAs. Advocacy, lobbying and influencing policy makers are the top strategic priority of all LCAs.

Over the course of the project, the provincial LCAs have been working to develop their collective position towards the Provincial government with regard to recognition of local government and their respective Local Government Acts. To date the following have been produced:

- LCA-KP produced an advocacy paper with recommendations with regard to revisions of the KPK local government act which was discussed at the General meeting in April 2019 and circulated widely, including to Chief Minister KP, Minister of LG, KPK, Secretary LG and head of Prime Minister Taskforce on LG.
- Over the course of this year LCAP advanced its advocacy strategy and hit a key objective in its recognition as the collective voice of local government when it was invited to be a member of the committee reviewing the Local Government Act, which met repeatedly over the course of 2019 to propose changes to the LG Act to bring this more in line with the greater decentralisation present in the KP Act.
- President and Executive members of LCAB held a meeting with Secretary LG Baluchistan on October 27, 2019. During the meeting, they discussed the on-going legislation for local government in the province and any period for the LG elections and presented the LCA's recommendations for improving decentralization and strengthening local government in the province.
- LCAS is in the process of developing a set of recommendations with regard to changes to the provincial local government act. The Ministry of local government is actively interested to receive these recommendations and has confirmed that they will be considered in the Act review process.

At the Federal level a background paper was produced for the 1<sup>st</sup> National Conference which took place in January 2019. The Paper included an analysis of the evolving state of local government in the four provinces of Pakistan. At the end of the National conference the 4 LCAs and the ADLG produced a joint advocacy statement with the core recommendations for strengthening local government as an actor in national development (see annex). This statement guided the ADLG's advocacy over the course of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project.

### ***ER 6: Effective management of the project, facilitating achievement of project results, good coordination between partners and other stakeholders and visibility for the project.***

There is a project team in place, working to deliver the project. The team brings together local knowledge and experience in Pakistan with international skills and experience, based



primarily in CLGF's UK office. It has been designed to ensure that there is capacity in the provincial LCAs to start to build longer term sustainability within the Pakistan LCAs. In the extension period of the project a set of additional officers will be added to the project, specifically a Communications & IT officer and a Women and Minorities Empowerment office. This additional capacity will allow the project to deepen its work in some important focal areas such as councilor training and outreach to marginalised groups.

### **A6.1 Project set up**

This process was completed in year one

### **A6.2 project coordination, monitoring and evaluation modalities set up**

The Strategic Advisor works closely with a project manager in London and the LCA coordinators to agree work plans, and design activities; implementation is normally led by the LCA Coordinators with advice and guidance from the strategic adviser and project manager. Support is provided by administrative staff, drivers and finance staff based at the project office in Lahore and in the provinces.

London based Project Officer is in place and working full time on the project, ensuring regular coordination with the LCA Coordinators, the Strategic Advisor, and Finance officer. He is also strengthening the project's political and practical connections with key development partners and funding agencies, and in general oversees the smooth implementation of all project activities.

The CLGF Programme Manager oversees the project activities and guides the staff in London and Pakistan on the strategic lines of the project, as well as looking for further opportunities to build the capacity of the project team and LCAs and to bring in new project and build new partnerships to further ensure the long-term sustainability of the LCAs

Key actions which took place in year 3 of the project were:

- The provincial LCA Coordinators are working with the elected members of the executive committee and President to deliver the strategic agenda of the LCA. There was some turnover of LCA Coordinators in the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project with both Baluchistan and Sindh changing coordinators however the project strategic advisor and the London based project officer worked with the new coordinators to ensure they were fully up to speed in the project objectives and activities and were clear on their roll and responsibilities both to the project as well as to the LCA board of governors.
- The Project Officer (PO) based in London undertook a support mission to Pakistan in July 2019 to support the TALD pilot project implementation in KP.
- CLGF also bought in project management support from a recognised local government expert over the course of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year to support the implementation of important activities in Sindh and Baluchistan.
- Regular communication in the form of Skype meetings and Whatsapp groups are organized bringing together LCA Coordinators, the Strategic Advisor and the PO on the progress of the project and share information and exchange regularly and to iron out any issues and facilitate the smooth implementation of the project activities.

- CLGF continued to discuss its upcoming activities with GIZ so as to ensure synergies between the two local governance programmes. CLGF also communicated regularly with UCLG ASPAC with regard to the support to LCAs in Baluchistan and Sindh as well as to the ADLG so as to avoid overlap and ensure the maximum benefit for the LCAs.

At the end of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of the project (in December 2019) the project faced a significant logistical problem as the LCAP and ADLG were required to register with the National Economic Affairs Division (EAD). This resulted in LCAP euro project account being frozen until the registration was processed and CLGF not being able to transfer additional project funds for the ongoing implementation of the project. Currently this is not an operational problem as project funds remain sufficient in the project's operational account and the project's strategic advisor supported by the wider LCAP team have submitted the application for this registration and are working to provide the necessary supporting documentation to the authorising bodies.

### **1.1. Logframe matrix updated**

Currently there are no changes proposed to the objectives, activities and targets, the only changes are in the baseline (see red for additions).

	Results chain	Indicators	Baseline (incl. reference year)	Current value Reference date	Targets (incl. reference year)	Sources and means of verification	Assumptions
Overall objective: Impact	OO. Strengthened associations of local authorities (ALAs) are supporting and enhancing the contribution of local government to good governance and development in Pakistan.	1. Pakistan's HDI score  2. Pakistan's WGI score  3. Change in Commonwealth Local Government Handbook Pakistan Profile	1. HDI value 0.556 (2016)  2. WGI value for Government effectiveness 24.17 percentile ranking (2013)  3. CLGF Handbook 2015/16	HDI value 0.560, rank 152 out of 189 (2018)  WGI value for Government effectiveness 26.92 percentile ranking (2018)  CLGF Handbook 2017/18	1. HDI value 0.560, Rank 152  2. WGI score for Pakistan Government effectiveness  3. CLGF Handbook 2019/20	Human Development Index (HDI) ( <a href="http://hdr.undp.org/en/content/human-development-index-hdi">http://hdr.undp.org/en/content/human-development-index-hdi</a> ) World Governance Indicator (WGI) ( <a href="https://info.worldbank.org/governance/wgi/Home/Reports">https://info.worldbank.org/governance/wgi/Home/Reports</a> ) CLGF handbook	
Specific objective(s): Outcome(s)	SO1. National and provincial ALAs can better support and represent their member local governments;	1.1 Number of ALAs/ADLG recognised in policy dialogue by provincial/ national government	1.1. ALAs lack any formal or informal recognition in the governance and policy making process in Pakistan	1.1 1 ALA has formal recognition in provincial notification of membership fees deducted at source for LCAKP (LCAKP	1.1 One ALA has formal recognition from provincial government  1.2 Four (4) ALAs and one	1.1 MoU with provincial/ national government ministry or department.	Political support for elected local government is maintained and ALAs and Local councils have the capacity and resources to implement new

	SO2. Local government are effectively perform their role as actors in local development at the territorial level.	1.2 Number of ALAs fully functional (have internal policies, governance structures and are delivering member services). by the end of the project  2.1 Number of councils that are delivering using the TALD process	1.2. The ALAs do not have internal policies or active governance structures and the ALAs are not currently delivering member services 2.1 Councils are not delivering participatory governance in most local government in Pakistan (2016)	2017); LCAP signed MoU with Provincial Ministry of Population Welfare in January 2019. 1.2 Four (4) ALAs have internal policies, governance structures (as of 2017/18)  2.1 four (4) councils are piloting the TALD process though implementation is currently on hold due to end of local council terms in office (2019)	(1) ADLG are fully functional and constituted  2.1. Councils in the 4 Provinces of Pakistan are delivering using the TALD process	1.2 ALA & ADLG meeting and activity reports  2.1. Pilot case studies, reports and council documentation	approaches Political buy in at the local council level to implement changes and to continue to support ALAs as a means of reinforcing local governance and development in Pakistan.
<b>Outputs</b>	<b>Output 1</b> 1.1. Five Capacity assessment reports produced	1.1. Number of Capacity assessment	1.1 Zero (0) (2016)	1.1 Five (5) (2017)	1.1 Five (5)  1.2.1 at least	1.1 Capacity reports	Project partners do not adopt new approaches and political/financia

	1.2. Better informed membership of ALAs and ADLG	<p>produced.</p> <p>1.2.1 Number of ALA and ADLG members participating in ALA/ADLG meetings disaggregated by sex</p> <p>1.2.2 Number of ALA and ADLG members participating in governance structures disag by sex</p>	<p>1.2.1 No members participating in formal ALA and ADLG meetings (as no meeting taking place)</p> <p>1.2.2 No of institutional meetings taking place (AGM &amp; BOG)</p>	<p>1.2.1 All BoGs and have met at least once, all ALAs have held at least 1 AGM (as of Jan 2019)</p> <p>1.2.2 BoG fully constituted in 4 ALAs and ADLG (as of Jan 2019); Minimum 1 AGM held in all ALAs &amp; ADLG</p>	<p>400 of members participating in Annual AGMs, and Board Meetings</p> <p>1.2.2 number of BoG &amp; AGM meetings</p>	<p>1.2.1 participant lists of AGM &amp; BoG</p> <p>1.2.2 AGM reports, election reports, ALA websites, media materials</p>	1 uncertainty impacts negatively on the sustainability of results
	1.3. Five Strategic plans and costed budgets for implementation	1.3. Number of plans (a) available, (b) validated by the membership and (c) implemented	1.3 No strategic plans in place (2016);	1.3 Strategic plans (a) in place and (b) validated by the members in the 4 ALAs and the ADLG (Sept 2019) (c) implementation underway (Jan 2020)	1.3 Four (4) ALAs and ADLG have strategic plans (a) in place, (b) validated by members and (c) being implemented	1.3 (a) Strategic plan document, strategic plan budget, (b) Executive or BOG committee meeting minutes (c) strategic plan progress report	

	1.4.Improved visibility for ALAs and ADLG (including web presence)	1.4 Number of active ALAs and ADLG websites	1.4 No active websites	1.4 Five active websites (Jan 2018) Websites functionality reviewed (Dec 2019) content updated regularly (ongoing)	1.4 Four (4) ALAs and (1) ADLG websites developed and regularly updated.	1.4 Websites and media presence, project reporting	ALAs and ADLG maintain and regularly update website and users access
	1.5. Advocacy materials promoting LG as a development actor supporting dialogue with the provincial government	1.5. Number of ALAs and ADLG producing advocacy materials	1.5.1 Limited number of advocacy materials (2015)	1.5 ADLG, LCAP and LCAKP have each produced at least one positions paper (Jan 2019) work on position papers in LCAB and LCAS underway (Jan 2020)	1.5 Four (4) ALAs and ADLGs regularly produce and disseminate advocacy materials	1.5 Website, position papers and reports of advocacy campaigns	Lack of political support for elected local government
	1.6. Five (5) Financial sustainability/ membership fee strategies validated and being implemented	1.6. Annual revenue of ALAs and ADLG (disaggregated between membership fees and other sources)	1.6. ALAs and ADLG have no revenue (membership fees or other)	1.6 two (2) ALAs & ADLG collecting some membership fees (Feb 2019); work on financial sustainability planning (planned March 2020)	1.6 Four (4) ALAs and the ADLG are collecting at least 25% of projected annual membership fees	1.6 financial sustainability strategy documents, ALA & ADLG membership accounts	

	1.7 four (4) Women and Minority Strategic plans	1.7 Number of plans (a) available, (b) validated by the membership and (c) implemented	1.7 No strategic plans in place (2016);	1.7 Strategic plans (a) in place and (b) validated by the members and in 1 ALA (Jan 2019)	1.7 Four (4) ALAs have strategic plans (a)in place, (b) validated by members & (c) being implemented	1.7 (a) Strategic plan document, strategic plan budget, (b) Executive or BOG committee meeting minutes (c) strategic plan progress report	
	1.8. Two national ALA conferences contributing to raising the profile of LG as a development actor in Pakistan	1.8.Number of national conferences held	1.8. None	1.8 one national ALA conference held (Jan 2019)	1.8 Two (2)	1.8 Conference reports and materials, evaluation forms	
	<b>Output 2</b>						
	2.1. Local stakeholders capacities on TALD in four (4) provinces built	2.1. Number of local councillors and stakeholders trained in TALD approaches	2.1. Zero councillors and stakeholders trained in the TALD approach	2.1 200 Local councillors and stakeholders trained on TALD (July 2019)	2.1 At least 200 local councillors and other local stakeholders	2.1 Training reports, and practitioner tracking	
	2.2.Toolkit guide on TALD for councillors and local stakeholders	2.2. Number of Toolkit guides available	2.2. No toolkit exists	2.2 one (1) toolkit on TALD developed (June 2019)	2.2. Toolkit produced and tested	2.2 toolkit document	
	2.3. Ten pilot projects delivering TALD	2.3. Number of pilot projects on	2.3. Zero	2.3 four (4) pilot projects	2.3 Eight (8) pilot councils	2.3 Project reporting, case	

		TALD reporting successful implementation of the TALD approach in their areas		delivering TALD approach (Aug 2019) though stalled prior to completion by premature end of tenure/delay in calling local elections (Jan 2020)	have delivered pilot projects using TALD	study and local stakeholder feedback	
Activities	A 1.1 ALA and ADLG capacity assessments A 1.2 Development of strategic plans for ADLG and ALAs A 1.3 Membership fee structure and revenue mobilisation plans for ADLG and ALAs A 1.4 Consultation meetings and ALA General Meetings held A 1.5 2 ADLG national conferences undertaken A 1.6 Resource and sustainability planning A 1.7 Strategic planning - women and minorities A 2.1 TALD workshops delivered A 2.2 Guide for councillors on their role in local development written and published A 2.3 Web content on TALD developed A 2.4 Councillor Inception Training A 2.5 Online training tools A 3.1 Selection of 10 pilot councils		<b>Means:</b> <i>What are the means required to implement these activities, e. g. staff, equipment, training, studies, supplies, operational facilities, etc.</i> <b>Costs</b> <i>What are the action costs? How are they classified? (Breakdown in the Budget for the Action)</i> Total cost of the action: 1,726,748.25 Euros Total EU contribution: 1,500,000 Euros Total co-funding contribution: 226,748.20 Euros Human Resources: 589,809.20 Euros Travel: 37,000.00 Euros Equipment and supplies: 115,150.00 Euros Local office: 137,400.00 Euros Other costs: 706,149.21 Euros Others: 28,275.00 Euros Administration: 112,964.84 Euros				Limited resources available, lack of commitment to implement activities, and political unrest in the country. Lack of resources to engage all members, limited capacity to deliver new approaches



	A3.2 Pilot projects implemented A4.1 Websites and web materials developed for ADLG and ALAs A5.1 Production and use of advocacy strategy and materials A6.1 Project set up A6.2 project coordination, monitoring and evaluation modalities set up A6.3 Project closure		
--	---	--	--

The Coordinator may unilaterally amend the activities, outputs, all the indicators and the related targets, baselines and sources of verification described in this logical framework in accordance with Article 9.4 of the General Conditions. Any change must be explained in the reports, whenever possible anticipatively. In case of doubt it is recommended to check beforehand with the Contracting Authority that the proposed modifications do not impact the basic purpose of the action.

<Please list all contracts (works, supplies, services) above € 60 000 awarded for the implementation of the action during the reporting period, giving for each contract the amount, the name of the contractor and a brief description on how the contractor was selected.>

One contract was above € 60,000 was awarded during the 2<sup>nd</sup> year of the project to: Motor House Pvt Ltd for €76,087.00. The process for this contracting was as follows

Step 1: Publish request for Quotations to provide Vehicles for SALG with term and conditions in national newspaper and webpage of LCAP.

Step 2: LCAP received sealed quotations from interested parties.

Step 3: LCAP Procurement Committee called for meeting to evaluate sealed quotations.

Step 4: In procurement Committee meeting sealed quotations opened in front of committee members, after examination of all quotations a evaluation sheets was filled in to make comparison on the basis of the key specification: (1) pricing and (2) general terms and conditions. Following this process and examining the outcomes the Committee recommends the Motor House Pvt Ltd to purchase Vehicles as Motor House was clearly assessed as best offer.

1.2. Please provide an updated action plan for the future activities of the project<sup>2</sup>

**The following is the Work Plan for Year 4 of the Programme:**

Activity													Organisation
	Jan	2	3	4	5	J u n	7	8	S e p	10	11	D e c	
<b>RESULTS AREA 1</b>													
1.2 Implementation of ALA strategic plans													LCAS, LCAB, LCA-KP, LCAP, ADLG
1.3 Implementation of ALA membership strategies													LCAS, LCAB, LCA-KP, LCAP
1.4 Annual General Meetings													LCAs/CLGF
1.4 BoG Meetings + Executive Committee meeting													LCAP, LCAB, LCAS, LCA-KP and ADLG
1.5 National Conference													CLGF/LCAs, ADLG and partners
1.5 National Position Paper													CLGF
1.6 Resource Sustainability planning													LCAs/CLGF/Expert
1.7 Strategic planning for Minority and Women Councillors in Sindh, KP and Baluchistan													LCAs/Expert/CLGF
1.7 Minority and Women Councillors in Sindh, KP and Baluchistan – activity implementation													LCAS, LCAB, LCA-KP
<b>RESULTS AREA 2</b>													
2.1 TALD Workshops with ALAs													CLGF/ALAs
2.3 Web content and case study on TALD pilots													Project team
2.4 Provincial level training for new councillors: development content													CLGF/LCAs/ Technical experts
2.4 Provincial level training for new councillors: workshops													LCAs/ Technical experts
2.5 Online Training Tools													Project team/Technical Expert
2.5 International exchange & learning													CLGF/LCAs members
<b>RESULTS AREA 3</b>													
3.2 Implement TALD pilots													CLGF/ALAs/pilot councils
Case study on TALD pilots													Project team

<sup>2</sup> This plan will cover the financial period between the interim report and the next report.

Activity													Organisation
	Jan	2	3	4	R 5	J u n	7	8	S e p	10	11	D e c	
<b>RESULTS AREA 4</b>													
4.1 Communications and Web support to ALAs and ADLG													CLGF/LCAs/ Technical experts
<b>RESULTS AREA 5</b>													
4.1 Provincial Position Papers													LCAs, LCAB, LCAP and LCA-KP
<b>RESULTS AREA 6</b>													
Hiring of Staff in Pakistan													CLGF/LCAP
Communications: increasing LCA visibility													LCAs
Communications: Increasing project visibility													CLGF/LCAP

## 2. Beneficiaries/affiliated entities and other Cooperation

---

2.1. How do you assess the relationship between the beneficiaries/affiliated entities of this grant contract (i.e. those having signed the mandate for the Coordinator or the affiliated entity statement)? Please provide specific information for each beneficiary/affiliated entity.

There is an excellent working relationship between CLGF and its co-applicant the LCAP. CLGF through its HQ and through Anwar Hussain, CLGF strategic project advisor, has built a strong relationship with the LCA beneficiaries of the project. The LCA Coordinators who are embedded within the Provincial LCAs in Sindh, Balochistan and KP play a dual role of ensuring the project implementation and responding to the LCA board of governors and executive, supporting the strategic actions of the association. In the 3rd year the project has been able to work more with the ADLG which is made up of representatives of the 4 provincial LCAs and which has a national and international remit.

2.2. How would you assess the relationship between your organisation and State authorities in the Action countries? How has this relationship affected the Action?

The project significantly advanced its relationship with key state representatives over the course of the 2<sup>nd</sup> year of the project and this culminated in the 1st national conference which took place in January 2019. Over the course of the 3rd year it strengthened links with the ministries of local government in each province, and continues to work to increase the visibility of the project at this level. CLGF's strategic advisor has been instrumental in supporting these relationships and ensuring that the LCAs and ADLG strengthen their linkages into the Ministries and Parliaments. The concrete impact of this progress can be seen in MoUs signed between LCAs and different Ministries, as well as the consultations and dialogues between the LCAs and the Provincial Ministries of local government.

Where applicable, describe your relationship with any other organisations involved in implementing the Action:

- Associate(s) (if any)
- Contractor(s) (if any)
- Final Beneficiaries and Target groups
- Other third parties involved (including other donors, other government agencies or local government units, NGOs, etc.)

CLGF and LCAP are well linked with the LCA Boards and membership in all four provinces. The four LCAs are the primary target beneficiaries and through the intensive institutionalisation process these relationships are strengthening all the time. In the third year of the project CLGF and its partners will have great opportunity to work with the LCA members through the TALD pilots as well as targeted work with specific LCA subgroups as directed by the LCA strategic plans.

Over the course of year 3 CLGF has also collaborated with GIZ on a number of activities. CLGF and GIZ continue to share project proposals and work plans towards improved coordination and complementarity and to avoid duplication. This will continue in year 4.

2.3. Where applicable, outline any links and synergies you have developed with other actions.

CLGF and UCLG ASPAC both have EU funded projects supporting local government in Pakistan and are actively working to ensure there are not overlaps and that as much as possible the projects can provide synergies for each other. The ADLG CEO is also the CLGF Strategic Advisor and as such is clear on the planned activities under both projects and is well placed to ensure the maximum benefit to the partner LCAs, however balancing the commitments to both projects as well as the ALAs own work programmes is increasingly challenging. CLGF through its strategic advisor remains attentive to upcoming projects of other actors and partners so as to identify and link up with other EC funded initiatives, where appropriate.

2.4. If your organisation has received previous EU grants in view of strengthening the same target group, in how far has this Action been able to build upon/complement the previous one(s)? (List all previous relevant EU grants).

Not applicable

### 3. Visibility

---

How is the visibility of the EU contribution being ensured in the Action?

The project continues to implement the communications and visibility strategy, and has updated this in line with the new priorities and time frame agreed in the project extension (see annex). The project follows the guidelines of the EC (Communication and Visibility of EU external action Handbook) in all communications (banners, workshop programmes, etc), the EU logo has been included as well as the mention of its co-financing role where appropriate. The same reference has been included in the publications and provincial/country level reports as these are produced. CLGF has produced a roller banner for the project as well as for specific project activities which it uses in all meetings to ensure clarity on the project and the link between the EU, CLGF and LCAP and the other ALAs.

News stories about the project activities are published in the local and national daily newspapers through issuing press releases. The national conference in January 2019 got ample print and electronic media coverage. All the banners, brochures and any communication related to the project bears EU logo.

CLGF also set up whatsapp groups of all members of the board of governors of provincial LCAs to share news and events related to local government in general and LCA in particular. These groups are very active and give access to the project team to interact with members of the LCAs and know about the issues and challenges they are facing related to local government.

**The European Commission may wish to publicise the results of Actions. Do you have any objection to this report being published on the EuropeAid website? If so, please state your objections here.**

CLGF is happy for the European Commission to publicise the results of the Action

Name of the contact person for the Action:

Lucy Slack, Deputy Secretary General

Signature:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'LS', written on a light blue grid background.

.....

Location: London, UK

Date report due: 20 April 2020

Date report sent: 20 April 2020